

**TOWARDS HUMAN TRAFFICKING PREVENTION:
NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL EXPERT GROUP
MEETINGS**

FINAL REPORT

31 May 2011

This Report has been prepared by a third party on behalf of Public Safety Canada. Although the Government of Canada will consider the report as it moves forward, it is not required or committed to implementing any of the recommendations made therein.



**The International Centre for Criminal Law Reform
and Criminal Justice Policy (ICCLR)/
Le Centre international pour la réforme du droit criminel
et la politique en matière de justice pénale (CIRDC)**

1822 East Mall, Vancouver, B.C. V6T 1Z1 CANADA
Tel.: + 1 (604)-822-9875 Fax: + 1 (604)-822-9317
Email: icclr@law.ubc.ca www.icclr.law.ubc.ca

ICCLR disclaimer: We are pleased to share this information with you and encourage you to use this document for research purposes. Please ensure that all credits are acknowledged when using all or any of the information in this document. Commercial reproduction is strictly prohibited.

I. OVERVIEW

The International Centre for Criminal Law Reform and Criminal Justice Policy (ICCLR), in collaboration with the International Centre for the Prevention of Crime (ICPC), with the financial support of Public Safety Canada, organized two expert group meetings on the prevention of human trafficking in Montreal in March 2011: one international and one national. The main goals of the project were to advance knowledge about the effective prevention of human trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation and forced labour and to delineate possible elements of a human trafficking prevention framework for Canada. This work may contribute not only to the prevention of human trafficking in Canada, but also to international efforts in various multilateral fora including the United Nations, the G-8, G-20 and the Organization of American States (OAS). The meetings focused on:

- identifying lessons learned in human trafficking prevention at the international, national, provincial and local levels;
- identifying internationally accepted crime prevention standards, which set out key principles, approaches and suggested roles for various levels of government; and,
- reviewing the obligations of States parties, including Canada, to prevent human trafficking under the *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime* (Palermo Protocol) and other relevant international norms and standards.

While the focus of the meetings was on the prevention of human trafficking, it became clear that a prevention framework for this crime – which is often organized and transnational – could also significantly contribute to enhancing prevention of other forms of organized crime. The Expert Group Meetings were preceded by two provincial roundtables on human trafficking prevention, held in British Columbia and Manitoba in March 2011, which fed into the Montreal meetings.¹

The British Columbia meeting, which was organized by the BC Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP), was held in Vancouver on March 3-4th 2011 and drew 65 participants, many of them from non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The province is the only one in Canada to have a dedicated office on trafficking in persons (OCTIP). The office was established in 2007, following a two-year initiative on human trafficking set up by the Ministries of Public Safety and Solicitor General and Child and Family Development. Since its establishment, the Office has developed partnerships with key anti-trafficking stakeholders (such as provincial and federal departments, municipal governments, law enforcement agencies and community organizations); undertaken training and awareness-raising activities; and developed

¹ ICCLR and ICPC participated in and benefited considerably from the discussions and conclusions arising from these provincial roundtable consultations.

policies and programmes to ensure that potentially trafficked persons receive the services they require. Over the past 4 years, several hundred women, men and youth have received OCTIP's assistance. The Office is currently developing a training curriculum and targeted e-learning training tools. While human trafficking prevention has always been acknowledged as a goal, in practice it is a new focus. Among the issues discussed at the BC meeting were the need to move beyond general awareness, the involvement of organized crime in human trafficking, approaches to prevent gang-related commercial sexual exploitation, and victim risk factors, such as children exiting state care and histories of past abuse. A concept paper on Crime Prevention and Human Trafficking² that identified a number of promising national and international programmes and a final report on the consultation meeting were prepared.

The Manitoba roundtable was organized by representatives from the Manitoba Human Trafficking Interdepartmental Committee and took place in Winnipeg on March 14th - 15th 2011. The meeting involved 44 participants from the provincial and federal governments and NGO communities. A background document was prepared.³ Since 2002, the province has had an on-going sexual exploitation strategy (re-launched in 2008 as Tracia's Trust) and current funding of over \$8 million annually, which links departments of Justice, Family Services and Status of Women, in partnership with the police and NGOs. Some 70% of sexual exploitation involves Aboriginal women and girls, so the strategy places a strong emphasis on working with Aboriginal leaders and communities in the development of Aboriginal-run services and approaches. On May 17th 2011, the Manitoba Government announced the expansion of its provincial strategy to include human trafficking. The provincial strategy includes a number of measures including a crisis hotline, youth stabilization opportunities, and a travel code. Under the Child and Family Services Act, a provincial specialized sexual exploitation and trafficking investigator position will be created to pursue, co-ordinate and investigate allegations and liaise with key professionals in other provinces and territories for services linked across Canada and other initiatives. The strategy builds on suggestions received during the two day roundtable. In relation to labour exploitation and trafficking, the implementation of the *Worker Recruitment and Protection Act*, adopted in 2009, appears to have demonstrated some success in reducing workers' vulnerability to trafficking. A number of themes were raised by roundtable participants including Aboriginal self-determination; education and increased training opportunities; legislative, justice and law enforcement considerations; and sustainable funding.

Both of the Montreal meetings included representatives from international and national organizations, national, provincial and local governments, law enforcement agencies, NGOs and networks, and academics. A survey of representatives of various Canadian jurisdictions and agencies was conducted to identify existing prevention initiatives and strategies. A background

² Wachtel, A. (2011). *Crime Prevention and Human Trafficking*. Vancouver: BC Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons. See also: *Report on the BC Consultation on the Prevention of Human Trafficking, March 3-4th 2011*, OCTIP.

³ *Background Document: Manitoba Roundtable on the Prevention of Trafficking in Persons*. Winnipeg, Manitoba Human Trafficking Interdepartmental Committee. 2011.

document was also prepared to help launch the discussion and some key questions were suggested to participants in advance of the meetings.

International Expert Group Meeting

The International Expert Group Meeting took place on 21st-22nd March, and involved 26 participants and from eight different countries (Australia, Canada, Finland, France, Germany, Sweden, South Africa, and the United States) and representatives from several international organizations, including the International Organization for Migration, the European Commission and the Organization of American States.⁴

At the outset, it was noted that there are numerous international instruments that call upon states to prevent human trafficking.⁵ Most directly, each State party to the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime* holds a responsibility to prevent human trafficking. Article 9 of the Protocol requires States parties to establish comprehensive policies, programs and other measures to prevent and combat trafficking in persons. The same article provides that States parties:

- shall endeavour to undertake measures such as research, information and mass media campaigns and social and economic initiatives to prevent and combat trafficking in persons. (Art. 9(2))
- that their policies, programmes and other measures established in accordance with this article, shall, as appropriate, include cooperation with non-governmental organizations and other elements of civil society. (Art. 9(3))
- shall take or strengthen measures, including through bilateral or multilateral cooperation, to alleviate the factors that make persons, especially women and children, vulnerable to trafficking, such as poverty, underdevelopment and lack of equal opportunity. (Art. 9(4))
- shall adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures, including through bilateral and multilateral cooperation, to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking. (Art. 9(5))

⁴ The meeting was conducted in English and French with simultaneous translation provided.

⁵ Canada is a party to: the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime; the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime; the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime; the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography; the Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women; and, the Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

Canada and other States parties to the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* must “take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form” (Art. 35). Other articles of the Convention aim to specifically protect children against all forms of sexual exploitation (Art. 34), economic exploitation and hazardous work (Art. 32), and all other forms of exploitation prejudicial to their welfare (Art. 36). The Convention’s *Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography* also calls on States parties to take effective action to prevent the commercial sexual exploitation of children and the sale of children, and to give particular attention to protecting children who are especially vulnerable to such practices (Art. 9).

Other international instruments also call for actions to prevent trafficking in persons, including the *Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women* (Convention of Belem do Para); the United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women, the United Nations Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power; and the International Labour Organization’s conventions setting a minimum age of employment and its *Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour*, as well as its Declaration on the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work.

Two other sets of internationally accepted guidelines can provide specific guidance on the development of human trafficking prevention initiatives: the *United Nations Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking* and on crime prevention in general, the *United Nations Guidelines on the Prevention of Crime*.

Major challenges in combating human trafficking in general were identified by participants, including the ambiguity created by different understandings among stakeholders of what constitutes human trafficking, the lack of official data of the prevalence of the problem, and the challenges resulting from the constantly changing criminal activity patterns and the mobility of criminal activities across countries and regions. To date, in most regions of the world the focus has been on developing criminal justice responses to human trafficking, particularly in relation to trafficking for sexual purposes. The initiatives highlighted and discussed during the meetings ranged from the development of victim services, the promotion of collaborative practices among police, border agencies, local authorities and non-governmental organizations, and, in some countries, attempts to specifically target users of and the demand for commercial sexual services. Fewer examples were reported of national initiatives to prevent human trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation, although some significant work in that area was reported by international organizations such as the International Labour Organization.

It was noted that national leadership, coordination and resources were key to fulfilling a State’s positive obligations to prevent human trafficking. Participants were in agreement about the importance of generating a national framework on the prevention of human trafficking that recognizes the need for action at all levels of government. National and international

cooperation and coordination were seen as crucial elements of any successful prevention framework. National referral mechanisms, which connect government and non-governmental anti-trafficking stakeholders, and national rapporteurs, who are responsible for collecting human trafficking information, were cited as good practices.⁶

Since labour trafficking has received less attention than trafficking for sexual purposes in most countries, there is limited information on its extent or on effective practices to prevent this form of trafficking. A recent three-country study, completed by the European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control (HEUNI) focusing on Finland, Estonia and Poland, suggested that known cases of labour trafficking represented only the tip of the iceberg in those countries. In relation to foreign workers, prevention approaches using the registration of workers and the enforcement of regulation and controls for employers and recruiting agencies are promising, as were initiatives based on collaboration with labour unions or aimed at increasing information and awareness among potential migrants in source countries. Participants in the expert meetings suggested it was important to mobilize private industry and service industries, including the hospitality and tourism industries, fast food and restaurant chains and remote mining and forestry camps, to assist with anti-trafficking prevention activities.

While there is reason to believe that human trafficking is itself underreported, other sources of information exist which are indicative of the kinds of exploitative behaviour often associated with human trafficking. It was noted that certain information and tools already exist, including police statistics, victimization surveys and local safety audits, which can help monitor changes in the prevalence and patterns of human trafficking and related activities, and assist the development and refinement of local prevention strategies. That said, the more general challenge of attempting to gain more precise information on what is essentially a clandestine activity was also acknowledged.

In relation to organized crime, participants agreed that relatively little is known about the criminal organizations involved in human trafficking, but that many of these networks/organizations seem relatively disorganized and small in scale. Some participants suggested that criminal organizations are perhaps more frequently involved in cases of trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, than cases involving labour exploitation. Nevertheless, it was emphasized by all participants that a comprehensive human trafficking prevention framework must take into account the role of organized crime groups and gangs, as well as the issue of corruption.

National Expert Group Meeting

The National Expert Group Meeting took place on March 23rd-24th in Montreal with a total of 31 participants including several federal and provincial government representatives, municipal

⁶ In certain European countries rapporteurs have the authority to collect information independently and have access to confidential files. It was noted that their annual reports can be helpful in the development of local prevention strategies and training programs for stakeholders.

government officials and police representatives, as well non-government organizations and networks and researchers. Five international participants also participated as resource persons in the national expert group meeting.

In the general discussion of vulnerabilities that may lead to human trafficking in Canada, certain groups were identified as vulnerable in Canada, including children exiting the child protection system, street children, runaway children, and children with histories of violence and abuse. Homeless individuals, illegal immigrants and foreign domestic and temporary workers are also at risk. Wide variations in the characteristics of victims of human trafficking and at risk populations were noted across the country. For example, in Manitoba and British Columbia, Aboriginal girls are reported to be especially vulnerable to sex trafficking. It was reported that in Ontario, East European girls and women had been victims of sex trafficking, and East European men of labour trafficking, while Asian women and girls were reported to be particularly vulnerable to sex trafficking in British Columbia. Awareness of their vulnerability to human trafficking, whether for sexual or labour exploitation, varies among vulnerable groups. This may result from the fact that these groups are not equally targeted by appropriately designed awareness raising campaigns and activities.

Initiatives at the provincial and local levels were also highlighted which could form key components of a national framework. A wide range of experiences and promising practices were discussed at the meeting, including child protection and crime prevention initiatives using social development, community, situational and regulatory, and other approaches. It became quite clear to participants that there are already a number of prevention programmes specifically targeting various vulnerable groups, including groups who are also vulnerable to other types of victimization. These initiatives could be expanded to target human trafficking more directly. At a minimum, front-line workers and service providers delivering these programmes should be made aware of the risk factors associated with human trafficking so as to reduce these vulnerabilities. Additionally, these initiatives could be built incrementally into a comprehensive prevention framework.

The apparent lack of coordination and collaboration among the agencies and organizations involved in prevention activities was deplored, although it was also noted that some stakeholders' networks are emerging in various parts of the country. Also deplored was the mutual distrust and poor communication which too often characterized relationships between government agencies at the federal and provincial levels and the numerous NGOs working in the field with actual or potential victims of trafficking and concerned with the conditions and rights of children, Aboriginal women and girls, migrants, immigrants and refugees.

Similar to the legislation adopted in Manitoba to regulate the recruitment of temporary foreign worker recruitment (*Worker Recruitment and Protection Act, 2009*), Ontario enacted legislation in 2010 to protect the employment conditions of foreign nationals.⁷ However, it was

⁷ Not all provinces were present at the roundtable nor were all surveyed in terms of their legislative initiatives to address trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation.

generally felt that the prevention of human trafficking for the purpose of labour trafficking had not received sufficient attention. Participants discussed a range of general and specific prevention measures that can be considered to address this particular type of human trafficking.

Participants agreed that Canada needs a comprehensive policy and program framework for the prevention of human trafficking. This framework would need to be flexible and adaptable to enable modification in relation to changes in the patterns of trafficking, demand, vulnerability and exploitation, as well as local contexts. It should build on existing structures and partnerships, rather than establishing a stand-alone system. This would require a focus on coordination structures and agreements across federal-provincial/territorial and local jurisdictions, and on means to enable action at all levels and, in particular, at the local level.

Participants agreed that a prevention strategy should focus primarily on the exploitation aspect of human trafficking. Given the need to utilize a broad prevention framework in considering causal and protective factors, and in developing prevention programmes to respond to those factors, legal definitions, although essential for prosecution purposes, were seen by some participants as restrictive in relation to a comprehensive prevention strategy. In addition, some participants stressed the importance of greater law enforcement and effective prosecution practices to increase the deterrent (and thus preventive) aspects of the law. A national human trafficking prevention framework would complement and reinforce prosecution and protection activities, and the knowledge gained through prosecution and protection activities should be cycled back to inform prevention.

II. MAIN CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE EXPERT GROUP MEETINGS

Trafficking is a complex and multi-faceted activity and a national framework should correspondingly involve a multi-sector response with a range of approaches targeting trafficking for sexual as well as labour purposes, and addressing both supply and demand issues. In some regions of the world, there has been extensive work over the past ten years since the adoption of the Palermo Protocol to increase awareness of the problem, collect information, identify criminal patterns, provide victim services, and to coordinate action between governments and civil society organizations, but the focus has been primarily on law enforcement, the prosecution of offenders and the protection of victims, not on prevention.

The international experience to date suggests there is a need to move from general awareness-raising to more targeted and focused awareness-raising and training programmes, behavioural change programmes, and programmes focused on increasing the resilience of communities of origin of trafficking victims, and building their capacity, e.g. through job and skills training or programmes encouraging girls to stay in school.

There is a need to focus on the prevention of victimization and re-victimization, and to learn from the successes and failures of prevention initiatives that have been developed to accomplish these goals. It would be important to work towards a shared understanding of what government services and civil society organizations can bring to a coordinated approach to trafficking prevention. In gathering data and assessing the extent of human trafficking from a prevention point of view, it would be very helpful to focus on assessing vulnerable groups and sectors, using wide ranging data sources, including existing data sets and qualitative material.

A. Proposed Guiding Principles for a Human Trafficking Prevention Framework

There are a number of guiding principles that should be considered in developing a prevention framework for human trafficking. Trafficking in persons often involves a complex chain of events and actors. The actors involved can include those who recruit victims, facilitate the crime, exploit and profit off the victims, and the victims themselves. Events can be wholly domestic or cross international borders and can include all forms of human trafficking for any purpose. In light of this complexity, a prevention framework should be multi-faceted, and involve governments at all levels, a range of government departments, as well as civil society and non-government organizations. The framework should address both domestic and international elements, and recognize that there is often overlap in the kinds of conditions and factors that place people at risk of being trafficked and exploited.

A national prevention framework should be based on international treaty obligations as well as the international norms and standards which provide a strong foundation for such a framework. Canada is party to the *UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime* and its protocols on trafficking in persons and smuggling of immigrants. The protocol on trafficking in persons requires States parties to take action to prevent human trafficking. The *UN Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking* (2002)⁸ and the *UN Guidelines on the Prevention of Crime* (2002) offer some guidelines for the development of a human trafficking prevention framework.

The *UN Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking* contain three principles concerning the prevention of human trafficking:

- strategies should address demand as a root cause of trafficking;
- states and organizations should ensure that their interventions address the factors that increase vulnerability to trafficking, including inequality, poverty and all forms of discrimination; and
- states should exercise due diligence to eradicate and punish public-sector complicity in trafficking.

⁸ For further details, see project Discussion Document at 10-11.

The same guidelines also recommend some specific prevention strategies relating to migration:

- ensure that potential migrants, especially women, are informed about the risks of migration and how to safely migrate (consideration 4);
- modify policies that compel people to resort to irregular/vulnerable labour migration (consideration 5); and
- examine ways to increase opportunities for legal, gainful and non-exploitative labour migration as long as the state has regulatory/supervisory mechanisms to protect the rights of migrant workers (consideration 6).

A prevention framework should reflect a commitment to ensure that all prevention activities are rights-based and avoid creating “collateral damage” or an adverse impact on the rights and dignity of persons we are trying to protect.

A prevention framework should also be guided by the basic principles outlined in the *2002 UN Guidelines for the Prevention of Crime*⁹:

- government leadership – at national, sub-regional and local levels;
- socio-economic development and inclusion – the integration of crime prevention into relevant social and economic policies, and a particular emphasis on at-risk communities, children, families and youth;
- cooperation and partnerships across ministries and between authorities, community organizations, non-governmental organizations, the business sector and private citizens;
- sustainability and accountability - with adequate funding to establish and sustain programmes and their evaluation, and clear accountability for funding;
- the use of a knowledge base - with strategies, policies and programmes based on a broad multidisciplinary foundation of knowledge and evidence about crime problems, their causes, and effective practices;
- respect for the rule of law and human rights, and the promotion of a culture of lawfulness;
- interdependency - taking account of the links between national and local crime problems and international organized crime; and
- differentiation - developing strategies that respond to the different needs of men and women, and vulnerable members of society.

The same guidelines also outline four main approaches to crime prevention which can be utilized and combined within an overall strategy: crime prevention through social development (which could include supports for victims of trafficking or those at risk of being trafficked);

⁹ For further details, see *id.* at 11-13.

community – or locally-based crime prevention; situational crime prevention (e.g. which could include such approaches as the regulation of industry and services and recruitment agencies, and crime prevention through preventing recidivism by assisting in the social reintegration of offenders).

A national prevention framework should incorporate relevant international obligations, norms and standards, placing particular emphasis on ensuring human rights and gender equality. The human rights of victims or potential victims of trafficking need to be upheld and protected. In particular, specific issues at entry and border points, or issues of investigation and prosecution, may be in conflict with victims' human rights, including their right to information and redress, or their protection. Migrants who are potential victims of trafficking need to know where to seek advice and know their rights in relation to the conditions of their work. Cultural and ethnic factors and racial discrimination have been noted in human trafficking and related exploitative activities. Given that the considerable majority of sex trafficking victims are women and girls, it is important to ensure that gender-based inequality and discrimination are addressed in a comprehensive way in prevention strategies.

B. Possible Elements of a Human Trafficking Prevention Framework

More specific factors to be taken into consideration that may help lay the groundwork for the prevention framework in Canada and other like-minded countries include:

- i. Target exploitation, the crux of the crime
- ii. Focus on trafficking for both sexual and labour purposes
- iii. Focus on domestic trafficking as well as international trafficking
- iv. Focus on both supply and demand
- v. Develop national government leadership to ensure a comprehensive prevention framework
- vi. Build on existing structures as far as possible
- vii. Develop partnerships and coordination mechanisms
- viii. Develop a good evidence base and build on existing data and sources
- ix. Monitor and evaluate initiatives
- x. Build capacity and community resilience

i. Target exploitation, the crux of the crime

Experts agree that the hallmark of the crime of human trafficking is exploitation. Given the complexity of human trafficking, the wide range of causal factors, variations in victims and sectors involved, and the difficulties of identifying victims, it is important for a national framework to have a broad focus, rather than be restricted by legal definitions of trafficking and whether or not certain activities meets a legal definition. A comprehensive prevention framework would target actors currently linked to exploitation, such as organized criminal groups, including

gangs, as well as the broader factors that lead to vulnerability, such as gender inequality and violence.

Prevention strategies should also be developed to target the most vulnerable groups, places and systems of exploitation or potential exploitation along the trafficking continuum, rather than simply targeting movement, migration or borders. Targeting potential exploitation requires an understanding of the vulnerabilities correlated with human trafficking, such as poverty, age, gender, social exclusion, lack of education, dysfunctional families or institutions, limited economic opportunities, politically unstable environments, and social, cultural and/or legal frameworks that reinforce power imbalances.¹⁰ Prevention policies should further be informed by what we know about offenders' grooming behaviours in relation to sexual exploitation and other ways they prey on victims.

ii. Focus on trafficking for both sexual and labour purposes

It is important to recognize that both forms of trafficking exist. There is considerable overlap in terms of the factors that create vulnerability to trafficking for labour or sexual purposes, including poverty and inequality, however, men and women are differently affected by labour and sex trafficking, different groups of people are targeted, and different recruitment methods are used. This means that strategies to prevent trafficking for sexual or labour purposes need to be tailored accordingly using a range of interventions, regulation or legislation.

iii. Focus on domestic trafficking as well as international trafficking

Trafficking within Canada affects both domestic and international victims. The *Criminal Code of Canada* defines human trafficking so as to include all offences whether they occur wholly in Canada or across borders¹¹. While international cooperation treaties and protocols are important to prevent these crimes at the international level, enhanced cooperation agreements and protocols among domestic agencies and governments are also crucial. While the vulnerabilities and risk factors at play may be similar, differences between patterns of recruitment and exploitation involving foreign and domestic victims need to be taken into account.

iv. Focus on both supply and demand

Measures should be put in place to discourage employer and consumer demand that lead to trafficking. The demand side is seen to include the immediate purchasers of the sexual services

¹⁰ Tightening migration rules, in itself, has been ineffective at preventing human trafficking. Many experts, as well as the *UN Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking*, have stressed that safe migration options are important to prevent human trafficking as people will migrate despite attempts to prevent them from doing so.

¹¹ The crimes are also defined in the provisions of Canada's *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act* (IRPA), Articles 117-121.

of trafficked victims as well as employers of trafficked and exploited labour. A state's policy on prostitution (prohibition, quasi-prohibition or regulation) is an area requiring specific attention and is subject to significant debate both domestically and internationally, although few countries have evaluated their policy in this regard. Demand also includes the wider area of consumer consumption choices involving exploited labour in the production of goods and services in supply chains, and should include a responsibility on behalf of states and the private sector. The supply chain includes the recruiters, transporters and main exploiters of trafficked victims, and a prevention strategy should also aim at the reduction of the trafficking enterprise, through an analysis of market patterns and regulation, inspection and enforcement initiatives.

v. Develop national government leadership to ensure a comprehensive prevention framework

A comprehensive framework to prevent human trafficking should recognize the importance of national leadership and responsibility, which includes the engagement of the federal, provincial/territorial and municipal governments. National actions should facilitate and enable provincial and territorial and local government action, while respecting jurisdictional competencies, as prevention activities will be most effective if undertaken at all levels of government. Coordination mechanisms as well as stable funding/resources are important for developing a sustainable comprehensive anti-trafficking framework.

vi. Build on existing structures as far as possible

A national framework should build on existing structures and programmes where possible. Various systems and services that have a duty to protect people who are vulnerable to human trafficking already exist, such as protection services for children, immigrants, refugees, labourers, abused women, etc. Building on these systems by raising awareness among front-line staff and through policies aimed to reduce clients' vulnerabilities to human trafficking is an important step in prevention. Further, as resources are scarce, they need to be carefully targeted, but not diverted from other social sectors. Existing crime prevention programmes, women's shelters, or support services for vulnerable groups, such as young Aboriginal women leaving remote reserves or coming out of care, all offer interventions that could be built upon to provide support and training to prevent human trafficking.

vii. Develop partnerships and coordination mechanisms

Developing partnership and coordination mechanisms is an essential element for a national framework. This coordination should be between national, provincial, territorial and local jurisdictions, as well as with non-government organizations that provide services and supports, or are working with at-risk groups, labour inspectors and labour unions and the business and private sector. Protocols for working together and sharing information and shared recognition of the competences and resource needs of all stakeholders are important. For example, better partnerships could lead to the development of toolkits and other materials providing better information and advice at border points, to labour unions and other stakeholders, as well as

through a range of entry points to reach those at risk of being trafficked. The private sector also represents an important partner in combating and preventing human trafficking since they are positioned not only to facilitate human trafficking (perhaps unknowingly), but more importantly to prevent it.

viii. Develop a good evidence base and build on existing data and sources

Given the difficulties of obtaining accurate data on the extent of trafficking, and the need for more qualitative and context-related information, it is important to extend the range of information sources and utilize the considerable information that already exists in different sectors, both government and non-government to inform prevention efforts. Sharing of information across agencies and non-government agencies could help to identify vulnerable individuals and abusers. Prevention activities are more likely to be successful where specific local characteristics and trafficking activities are taken into account and responses are tailored to the local context. At the local government level, safety audits can be used to assess current vulnerabilities and problems relating to trafficking, to assist in developing local action plans.¹²

ix. Monitor and evaluate initiatives

As with all crime prevention interventions, the monitoring and evaluation of initiatives to prevent trafficking is important and should be built in from the beginning to help build up baseline information, and enable outcomes to be assessed. This is also important for guiding the adaptation of programmes to meet their objectives more closely, and to provide accountability. In addition, collected and evaluated data can be used to effectively communicate to governments and other stakeholders the nature and extent of the problems encountered. This should include the use of both qualitative as well as quantitative information on trafficking victims and survivors and members of at risk groups.

x. Build capacity and community resilience

Experience from other countries suggests that prevention programmes need to be carefully targeted to build capacity within communities, and help increase their resilience to prevent trafficking. Capacity building initiatives could include programmes that provide job and skills training for young people at risk that offer sustainable work possibilities. Other promising capacity-building initiatives include specifically developed education and awareness programmes that target vulnerable groups, such as children in care, or high school children, as well as supports and programmes for local stakeholders and service providers in communities.

¹² See the *Guidance on Local Safety Audits. A Compendium of International Practice*, published in 2007 by the European Forum for Urban Safety, which was principally funded by Public Safety Canada. It includes a specific section (pp. 60-63) on the auditing of trafficking in persons at the local level.

C. Information Collection/Dissemination in Support of Effective Prevention

For effective context-specific prevention measures to be developed and properly implemented, it is essential to have access to good data on the problem and solid intelligence about crime patterns. To that effect, a number of specific measures should be included in a comprehensive prevention framework, including:

- Developing national and local diagnostics (safety audits) as a first step in the establishment of a national framework. These diagnostics could draw on relevant international standards and include information on: key government and civil society partners; sub-populations at-risk of being trafficked/exploited; employment sectors of concern; geographic areas of concern; current human trafficking prevention activities; and, existing knowledge and prevention gaps.
- Making already-existing information on human trafficking publically available in an easily accessible format, such as on a web page that is updated periodically. The recent release of the RCMP threat assessment on human trafficking is a positive example of such information sharing.
- Building on the survey of jurisdictions initiated by this project to gather information on current prevention in Canada, map existing activities and identify gaps; this could include a more in-depth analysis of existing projects, activities, and resources.

These recommendations, including guiding principles and elements, are proposed to assist Canada in determining its next steps and future efforts to prevent and combat human trafficking.

..-.-.